1	INCORPORATED VILLAGE OF THOMASTON
2	BOARD OF REVIEW - VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE
3	NOVEMBER 16, 2021
4	6:00 P.M.
5	
6	
7	PRESENT:
8	STEVEN WEINBERG, MAYOR
9	JAMES E. SHARKEY, DEPUTY MAYOR
10	JILL MONOSON, TRUSTEE
11	TO-ON PANG, TRUSTEE
12	BURTON S. WESTON, TRUSTEE
13	VILLAGE ATTORNEY, A. THOMAS LEVIN, ESQ.
14	DENISE KNOWLAND, VILLAGE ASSESSOR
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	JENNIFER DEVLIN COURT REPORTER
23	
24	

MAYOR WEINBERG: All right. Good evening. The Board of Review is meeting on November 16, 2021 via videoconference. We're opening the meeting at 6:11 p.m. And I have to read the following statement, as required by law.

Due to the public health and safety concerns related to COVID-19, and pursuant to New York State law, this meeting of the Board of Review is not being held in person. The board is meeting by videoconferencing. The meeting will be recorded and a transcription will be provided at a later date.

The public has the opportunity to observe

this meeting live online and submit comments pursuant to instructions given on the village website and in the meeting notice.

Interested members of the public may provide comments by calling in during the meeting at (646) 558-8656. Meeting ID: 896 8968 4479.

Password: 730522, or through the written chat section of the Zoom meeting. Comments may also be provided via email before and during the meeting to

1	clerk@villageofthomaston.org.
2	The Village Administrator will now call
3	the roll for attendance at this meeting by
4	members of the board and any relevant village
5	staff.
6	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay.
7	Deputy Mayor Sharkey.
8	DEPUTY MAYOR SHARKEY: Here.
9	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee
10	Weston.
11	TRUSTEE WESTON: Present.
12	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Mayor
13	Weinberg.
13 14	Weinberg. MAYOR WEINBERG: Here.
14	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here.
14 15	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay.
14 15 16	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. Trustee Jill Monoson and Trustee To-on Pang
14 15 16 17	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. Trustee Jill Monoson and Trustee To-on Pang are not present at the meeting at this time.
14 15 16 17	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. Trustee Jill Monoson and Trustee To-on Pang are not present at the meeting at this time. MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. Please note with
14 15 16 17 18	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. Trustee Jill Monoson and Trustee To-on Pang are not present at the meeting at this time. MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. Please note with the time and date of the entry to the meeting
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. Trustee Jill Monoson and Trustee To-on Pang are not present at the meeting at this time. MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. Please note with the time and date of the entry to the meeting when they come in.
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MAYOR WEINBERG: Here. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. Trustee Jill Monoson and Trustee To-on Pang are not present at the meeting at this time. MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. Please note with the time and date of the entry to the meeting when they come in. VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: I will.

filed. No taxpayer or representative of any 1 2 taxpayer appeared in person at the meeting. 3 At the moment is that still the case, Denise? VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: That is still 4 5 the case at the moment, so we will see if 6 anyone appears. 7 MAYOR WEINBERG: So do the motion now or 8 later? VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Later. At 9 10 the end we'll make the motion and -- as you 11 see the proposal. 12 MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. In the interest 13 of the village's taxpayers, we will look at 14 each other without comment so that we don't 1.5 run up the transcription cost. 16 VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. 17 should note that when I called the roll, I 18 failed to call myself. Denise M. Knowland, 19 acting as village assessor for the purpose of 20 this meeting. I am present. 21 MAYOR WEINBERG: And again I will enter 22 -- Denise, in the possibility that someone does enter the meeting and they're here for 23 24 the tax review board, please let us know.

1	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: I will.
2	(Whereupon, there is a pause in the
3	proceedings.)
4	TRUSTEE PANG: I'm back. Denise, can you
5	hear me?
6	MAYOR WEINBERG: I don't know if Denise
7	is having a problem with her audio. You want
8	to text her and let her know the time you
9	came back
10	TRUSTEE PANG: Sure.
11	MAYOR WEINBERG: or you can just state
12	it on the record since it's been recorded?
13	TRUSTEE PANG: I will put it on the chat
14	room.
15	MS. HALPERN: Hello, Denise. This is
16	Wendy Halpern. I have a question relating to
17	the tax grievance.
18	TRUSTEE PANG: You can speak to us. We
19	are the Board of Trustees. You can speak to
20	us.
21	MS. HALPERN: Hello.
22	TRUSTEE PANG: Wendy, can you hear me?
23	MS. HALPERN: Barely. It's faint.
24	MAYOR WEINBERG: Wendy, I'm sorry.

Denise is on the line. You said that you had 1 2 a question. 3 MS. HALPERN: I tried to send a chat, but it was disabled. 4 5 My question is what year is this the grievance for, 2022 and 2023? 6 7 MAYOR WEINBERG: Yes. 8 MS. HALPERN: Because I had authorized 9 Maidenbaum Property Tax Reduction to file a 10 grievance on our behalf, as we do every year. 11 And I'm surprised to hear that nothing was 12 submitted. 13 TRUSTEE PANG: I think you can talk to your property tax consulting firm. I think 14 1.5 some consulting firms choose not to grieve 16 the village tax. 17 MS. HALPERN: Well, I authorized --18 MAYOR WEINBERG: Ben, it has to be --19 Ben, it has to be only if the property owner 20 directed them to not grieve the village tax. 21 MS. HALPERN: No. I have an 22 authorization here that says, this email is 23 to acknowledge receipt of your signed 24 authorization to process your 23/24 county

and 22/23 village tax assessment. And then 1 it's our address. And I see now they're 2 3 listing as zip code 11023. I don't know if that matters. But they're supposed to be 4 5 doing every year for us. And we always just get told it's never been approved. 6 7 MAYOR WEINBERG: Denise. 8 MS. HALPERN: I have these going back in 9 my emails from 18/19. Every year for the 10 last however many years they've done it. 11 They said they did it at least. 12 MAYOR WEINBERG: Denise, do you have 13 any --14 VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: They did not 1.5 file. They did not file. I mean, I have the 16 whole list of everyone who filed from 17 Maidenbaum Property Tax Reduction Group. I 18 have a list from Maidenbaum Sternberg. I 19 checked that one as well. It hasn't been 20 filed here. 21 MAYOR WEINBERG: Denise, do you have 22 access to the list from last year? VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: I will look 23 24 and see if I can find last year's list and

1	see if it was on there.
2	Hold on a moment.
3	MAYOR WEINBERG: Wendy, was it on last
4	year's list?
5	MS. HALPERN: Well, they're supposed to
6	be. I'm going back in my emails. And I got
7	the county reductions.
8	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Let me see.
9	MAYOR WEINBERG: Denise
10	MS. HALPERN: I have 22/23. I have 21/22
11	that she said I authorized them
12	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: I'm looking.
13	Just give me a minute.
14	MS. HALPERN: I have 17/18, the year.
15	16/17.
16	MAYOR WEINBERG: Denise, is tonight the
17	deadline?
18	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Yeah.
19	MS. HALPERN: 15/16.
20	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Yes. This is
21	the deadline today.
22	Okay. So Maidenbaum Property Tax
23	Reduction I'm looking at last year's list.
24	Hold on a second. Let me go through. Nope.

It's not on there. I'm looking at Maidenbaum 1 2 Sternberg because -- in case there's any 3 confusion as to which company is supposed to do it. It's not on there either. I do not 4 5 see it for 21/22. Let me see if I can check --6 7 MS. HALPERN: So like, for example, --8 just looking at the most recent email. 9 MAYOR WEINBERG: Do you have -- obviously 10 I'm assuming Maidenbaum is certainly closed 11 now. 12 MS. HALPERN: Well, I didn't try them 13 yet. 14 MAYOR WEINBERG: Why don't you try them 1.5 and see if they can email it now? 16 MS. HALPERN: Okay. So I will do that. 17 I will call them. Because I'm looking at 18 other correspondence they have from prior 19 years. It says -- it said -- this is from 20 It says if we receive your 21 authorization at least 3 weeks prior to the 22 November 15, 2016, village filing deadline they would do it. I guess is that the 23 24 deadline? Like, you generally set a

different day? 1 2 VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: No. It's 3 November -- it's always the third Tuesday in November. November whatever the day. 4 5 MS. HALPERN: Okay. I'm going to put this on mute and I'm going to call them. I 6 7 highly doubt they will pick up the phone, but 8 I will try. 9 VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay. I don't see for 21/22 either. That's what I 10 11 can see. MS. HALPERN: Hi. There's no answer with 12 13 them, so I will send them an email. But 14 obviously they won't get it until at least 1.5 tomorrow. 16 Are you there? 17 MAYOR WEINBERG: We're here, Wendy. 18 MS. HALPERN: So I'm just going to email 19 them. I guess they missed the deadline. So 20 I guess that I have to deal with them on 21 that. Apparently they've been telling me 22 they've been doing it every year. And we've

never gotten a reduction. I just assumed the

village denied all of their applications, so

23

24

I never inquired further. 1 We thought the -- we've gotten reductions 2 3 from Nassau County. And I was always curious why the village never changed anything. But 4 5 I just figured that's just how it is. But now I'm hearing that it doesn't seem that 6 7 they ever filed anything for us. Do they 8 file for other people? You've gotten other 9 things for them? MAYOR WEINBERG: Yes. 10 11 MS. HALPERN: And do they do it by a 12 stipulation kind of document or individual? 13 MAYOR WEINBERG: No. It's a form. 14 Individual. 1.5 MS. HALPERN: Okay. Okay. So I'm just 16 going to deal with I guess -- is today the 17 deadline? There's extensions? 18 MAYOR WEINBERG: I don't believe there 19 are extensions. I think it's a hard 20 deadline. 21 MS. HALPERN: So were those other -- like 22 is it public record if you grant the other grievances? I don't know what the criteria 23

is. That's why we have them do it.

24

1	TRUSTEE PANG: I think, Wendy, in general
2	only very few cases are granted reductions
3	for village tax every year. From my
4	experience there is a handful. Less than
5	five.
6	MS. HALPERN: It's five actual
7	applications or 5 percent?
8	TRUSTEE PANG: No. Out of maybe 200
9	cases I think maybe grant two or three every
10	year.
11	MS. HALPERN: All right. Well, I'm going
12	to deal with I will just ask them.
13	Because if we're hiring them for a service
14	and they're not providing it, then, you know,
15	that's not right either.
16	All right. Well, I guess that answers
17	our questions.
18	MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. Thank you.
19	MS. HALPERN: Thanks. Thank you. Bye.
20	MAYOR WEINBERG: You're welcome.
21	(Whereupon, there is a pause in the
22	proceedings.)
23	MAYOR WEINBERG: Denise, are you
24	available?

1	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: I'm here.
2	Can you hear me?
3	MAYOR WEINBERG: We can hear you.
4	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Okay.
5	MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. Would the members
6	of the Board of Review please unmute
7	yourself.
8	TRUSTEE MONOSON: Okay. I'm here.
9	TRUSTEE PANG: I'm here.
10	MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay.
11	TRUSTEE WESTON: I'm here.
12	DEPUTY MAYOR SHARKEY: I'm here.
13	MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay.
14	On motion of basically the members of the
15	Board of Review, the members of the board
16	reviewed each property for which a grievance
17	has been filed. No taxpayer or
18	representative of any person appeared in
19	person. I'm going to amend that. Wendy
20	Halpern appeared and had a question about her
21	whether an application was filed for a tax
22	grievance with the village for the 2022/2023
23	tax year. And we confirmed that we have not
24	that the village had not received an

1	application from either Maidenbaum Property
2	Tax Reduction Group LLC or Maidenbaum &
3	Sternberg LLP.
4	There is a by motion of the Mayor,
5	Steve Weinberg, that the board denied an
6	assessed value I'm sorry. Denied changes
7	in assessed values.
8	TRUSTEE WESTON: Changes
9	MAYOR WEINBERG: I'm sorry.
10	TRUSTEE WESTON: Changes in assessed
11	value.
12	MAYOR WEINBERG: Thank you. Let me start
13	again.
14	Upon motion of Steven Weinberg, the Board
15	of Review denied changed in the assessed
16	value with respect to each of the properties
17	in the list of grievances for the 2022/2023
18	tax year.
19	Is there a second for the motion?
20	DEPUTY MAYOR SHARKEY: I'll make the
21	second.
22	MAYOR WEINBERG: Thank you, Jim.
23	Any comments or discussions by the board?
24	(There was no response.)

1	MAYOR WEINBERG: There being none,
2	Denise, please call the roll.
3	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Deputy Mayor
4	Sharkey.
5	DEPUTY MAYOR SHARKEY: Aye.
6	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee
7	Monoson.
8	TRUSTEE MONOSON: Aye.
9	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee Pang.
10	TRUSTEE PANG: Aye.
11	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee
12	Weston.
13	TRUSTEE WESTON: Aye.
14	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Mayor
15	Weinberg.
16	MAYOR WEINBERG: Aye.
17	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: And Assessor
18	Knowland.
19	Aye.
20	Six votes in favor, zero opposed. The
21	motion is adopted.
22	MAYOR WEINBERG: Okay. 10:15 p.m. Is
23	there a motion to adjourn?
24	TRUSTEE WESTON: So moved.

1	TRUSTEE MONOSON: I'll second. I'll
2	second.
3	MAYOR WEINBERG: Any comments or
4	discussion?
5	(There was no response.)
6	MAYOR WEINBERG: Hearing none, Denise,
7	please call the roll.
8	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Deputy Mayor
9	Sharkey.
10	DEPUTY MAYOR SHARKEY: Aye.
11	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee
12	Monoson.
13	TRUSTEE MONOSON: Aye.
14	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee Pang.
15	TRUSTEE PANG: Aye.
16	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Trustee
17	Weston.
18	TRUSTEE WESTON: Aye.
19	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Mayor
20	Weinberg.
21	MAYOR WEINBERG: Aye.
2.2	VILLAGE ASSESSOR KNOWLAND: Assessor
22	
23	Knowland.

1	Six votes in favor, zero opposed. The
2	motion is adopted. The minutes are now
3	closed the meeting is now closed.
4	MAYOR WEINBERG: Thank you all and good
5	night.
6	(Time noted: 10:15 p.m.)
7	* * *
8	CERTIFIED THAT THE FOREGOING IS A TRUE AND ACCURATE
9	TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES OF THIS HEARING AS TRANSCRIBED
LO	FROM AN AUDIO/VIDEO RECORDING, DONE TO THE BEST OF MY
L1	ABILITY.
L2	
L3	
L 4	JENNIFER DEVLIN
L5	Court Reporter
L6	
L7	
L8	
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	